

**Application Number** 19/00817/FUL

**Proposal** Installation of security, barbed wire on roof - retrospective

**Site** Doctors Surgery, 156 Stockport Road, Ashton-Under-Lyne.

**Applicant** Ms Alex Jones

**Recommendation** Refuse

**Reason for report** A Speakers Panel decision is required because, in accordance with the Council's Constitution, the applicant requested the opportunity to address the Panel before a decision is made.

## **1.0 APPLICATION DESCRIPTION**

1.1 The application seeks full planning permission to retain a row of coiled barbed wire that has been installed on top of the flat roof of a single-storey section of the building that fronts on to Pottinger Street and Kelvin Street.

## **2.0 SITE & SURROUNDINGS**

2.1 The doctors' surgery occupies a plot between Stockport Road and Kelvin Street, with its main frontage now on to Pottinger Street, in the West End of Ashton. Built originally as a detached house, the building has been substantially extended on the Stockport Road frontage. The building is mainly 2-storey but there is a single-storey, flat-roofed section on the northern side in Pottinger Street and Kelvin Street.

2.2 There is a 2-storey building, providing elderly persons sheltered accommodation next door and semi-detached houses across Pottinger Street on the same side of Stockport Road. There are terraced houses at the rear, in Kelvin Street, and across Stockport Road.

## **3.0. RELEVANT PLANNING POLICIES**

3.1 **Tameside Unitary Development Plan (UDP) Allocation**  
Unallocated

### **3.2 Part 1 Policies**

1.3: Creating a Cleaner and Greener Environment;  
1.5: Following the Principles of Sustainable Development  
1.12: Ensuring an Accessible, Safe and Healthy Environment.

### **3.3 Part 2 Policies**

C1: Townscape and Urban Form.

### **3.4 National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)**

Section 2. Achieving sustainable development;  
Section 12. Achieving well-designed places.

### **3.5 Other Policies**

It is not considered there are any local finance considerations that are material to the application.

### **3.6 Planning Practice Guidance (PPG)**

This is intended to complement the NPPF and to provide a single resource for planning guidance, whilst rationalising and streamlining the material. Almost all previous planning Circulars and advice notes have been cancelled. Specific reference will be made to the PPG or other national advice in the Analysis section of the report, where appropriate.

### **4.0 PUBLICITY CARRIED OUT**

4.1 As part of the planning application process 31 notification letters were sent out to neighbouring properties on 25th September 2019.

### **5.0 RESPONSES FROM CONSULTEES**

5.1 No responses have been received.

### **6.0 SUMMARY OF COUNCILLOR AND THIRD PARTY RESPONSES RECEIVED**

6.1 Councillor Bray has objected to the application on the grounds that the appearance of the barbed wire is inappropriate in the residential area.

### **7.0 ANALYSIS**

7.1 The applicant contends that the surgery not only holds the private medical information of over 8,000 patients but also has a chemist on site. In the 24 months prior to the installation of the barbed wire there were four attempted break-ins and one successful break-in when the criminals gained access to the pharmacy. Since the installation of the barbed wire there has not been a single incident.

7.2 Whilst the security benefits of the installation of the barbed wire are undoubted the issue to consider is whether these benefits outweigh the impact on the character and appearance of the building and the wider streetscene.

7.3 It is considered that the presence of the barbed wire is an untidy and foreboding element not only on the building but in the streetscene generally. The appearance of the barbed wire is not considered conducive to the maintenance of an appropriate and acceptable residential environment.

7.4 It has been suggested to the applicant that a temporary planning permission might be considered to allow for time for an alternative means of security to be explored but this option as not been accepted.

7.5 In order to be considered sustainable a development must be visually attractive so as to create better places in which to live. The surgery's security requirements are recognised and respected but, and in the absence of any alternative measures that would not be harmful to the appearance and character of the building and surrounding established residential environment being explored, the impact of appearance of the barbed wire is considered unduly detrimental and so constituting an unsustainable development.

## **9.0 RECOMMENDATION**

Refuse planning permission for the following reason:

As installed, the barbed wire is an untidy and foreboding element not only on the building but in the streetscene generally and so uncondusive to the maintenance of an appropriate and acceptable residential environment. The impact of appearance of the barbed wire is unduly detrimental to the appearance and character of the building and surrounding established residential environment and so constitutes an unsustainable development that is contrary to policies 1.3, 1.5 and C1 of the Tameside Unitary development Plan and Sections 2 and 12 of the National Planning Policy Framework.